

BIG SPRING SCHOOL DISTRICT

Newville, Pennsylvania

BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

MONDAY, OCTOBER 17, 2016

The Big Spring School District is an equal opportunity education institution and will not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, sex, age, religion, and disability in its activities, programs, or employment practices as required by Title VI, Title IX, and Section 504. For information regarding civil rights or grievance procedures, or for information regarding services, activities, and facilities that are accessible to and usable by handicapped persons, contact the Superintendent of Schools, Title IX and Section 504 Coordinator, 45 Mt. Rock Road, Newville, PA 17241, at (717) 776-2412.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The Buildings and Property Committee of the Board of School Directors for the Big Spring School District met in the Large Group Room, Room 140, of the Big Spring High School at 6:00 P.M. with Robert Barrick, Chairperson, presiding. Nine (9) directors present: Robert Barrick, Chairperson; William Swanson, Committee Member; Wilbur Wolf, Jr, ex-officio Committee Member; Richard Roush, Board Member; William Piper, Board Member; Bob Kanc, Board Member; Todd Deihl, Board Member; and Kingsley Blasco, Board Member; David Gutshall, Board Member.

Bob Kanc arrived at 6:05 pm. Todd Deihl arrived at 6:06 pm. Kingsley Blasco arrived at 6:13 pm.

Others in attendance: Richard W. Fry, Superintendent; Kevin C. Roberts Jr., Assistant Superintendent; Richard Kerr, Business Manager; Rick Gilliam, Director of Buildings, Grounds, and Transportation; and Carol Frace, Board Minutes.

II. DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Update on Middle School Roof

Mr. Kenneth Myers, Professional Roof Services provided information to the Board on the Middle School Roof Project.

Big Spring School Board Buildings and Property Committee Meeting Minutes Monday, October 17, 2016

General Questions:

1. Mr. Fry asked Mr. Myers to explain to the Board of School Directors the difference in the two roofing systems and why he feels the more expensive roof would be a better fit. How can we move forward in comparing the two systems as an apples to apples comparison?
2. Mr. Fry questioned how heavy duty clips that a manufacturing company stated that would be used to secure the roof from wind.
3. Mr. Fry inquired about the bid process and how we could compare apples to apples to see what is best. We have two completely different systems and we need to see the true cost comparison. You talked about bidding both systems and using one as an alternate bid.
4. Mr. Barrick asked what happens to the edge of the roof or flashing in both systems. What has to be changed on the roof profile if we use a built up roof. If we go with EPDM, what do we have to do? Will we continue to use the crickets to channel the water?
5. Mr. Kanc questioned the Garland Modified System. Are there proprietary or limited roofers to install it? Most of the time the failure comes at the flashing. Is there a difference between EPDM flashing? The failure is more in the workmanship. Would the warranty cover the workmanship?
6. Mr. Wolf inquired if we go to the membrane roof do the roof drains have to be relocated. Does that cause a concern for leakage down through the building? If we were starting from scratch, you wouldn't recommend the membrane roof because of high wind?
7. Mr. Fry reviewed with the Board of School Directors when we had the failure at the high school natatorium and boiler room, Syntec in time did offer a replacement. The reality was they were going to replace with a solution that had already failed. We made the decision to go with a built up roof. A warranty is only as good as a piece of paper. If it failed in wind, do we put down another single ply roof? We had this dilemma three years ago.
8. Mr. Piper asked about the insulation underneath these roofs. Are they the same?
9. Mr. Kanc questioned if it is being taken down to the deck. Would this be an adhesive? Will it always adhere? Do you do test cuts first?
10. Mr. Piper asked how thick the built up roof would be. How thick is 300 mills?
11. Mr. Roush advised the Board that it would be about ¼ of an inch thick.

**Big Spring School Board Buildings and Property Committee Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 17, 2016**

12. Mr. Wolf questioned if the stone is in additional to the 3 layers that are put down.
13. Mr. Barrick asked what the purpose of the stone is on the roof.
14. Mr. Wolf questioned if the 90 mill compared to 60 mill would wear better in high wind.
15. Mr. Kerr inquired what the roof is at Newville.
16. Mr. Tobie Wolf advised the Board of School Directors that the Newville roof is a modified roof system with white stones. He asked if they have ever spec'd a 90 mill roof with 30 year warranty EPDM. I just want to remind the Board that a 30 year 90 mill EPDM roof is not a proven roof. This is a newer roof. There are none out there.
17. Mr. Kerr inquired if you could ask for a Carlisle specification. It will be an open bid correct with no guarantee that it is Carlisle. Is there a way to incorporate the US community purchasing process into an open bid or we are going to do an open bid with a multi-ply with alternatives?
18. Mr. Fry informed the Board of School Directors the roof at the middle school is a Firestone roof and the high school is a Carlisle roof.
19. Mr. Kanc inquired if we legally have to accept the lowest bid.
20. Mr. Piper questioned if built up roofs have been out there for more than 30 years in this area. Mr. Piper asked if we are bidding apples to apples. How can we compare?
21. Mr. Wolf asked if we get bids for both systems. If the membrane roof is lower, do we have to take the lower membrane bid? Do we get to take the lower of the built up roof or the lower of the membrane roof? Do we have the right to bid both roofs and then decide which roof to take?
22. Mr. Kerr reviewed with the Board we would need to run this past the schools solicitor before we go out to bid. We have to be careful of lowest bidder with two different systems.
23. Mr. Fry stated before we write the specs will we make sure the school solicitor is in agreement. You can't mention any names at all. You can not use the word "FREE".
24. Mr. Barrick inquired if we have any record of wind speed on this roof.

**Big Spring School Board Buildings and Property Committee Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 17, 2016**

25. Mr. Gilliam stated that the wind speed is averaged at 10 miles per hour. Carlisle reported that the roof that failed was in excess of 55 miles per hour and the warranty doesn't cover excess of that speed.
26. Mr. Swanson advised that there was a report at one point that told us that information.
27. Mr. Kanc inquired about a 90 mill 30 year warranty what wind speed do they cover. Can you buy higher wind speeds? How much more will you pay for the max wind speed?
28. Mr. Roush reminded the Board the system that failed was an insulation flashing issue that created that problem. It was a November insulation and there were questions about the temperature for the adhesive. The adhesives were not recommended to be applied at those temperatures. We set up ourselves up for failure with that roof system.
29. Mr. Swanson questioned if it is the adhesive that failed not the membrane.
30. Mr. Tobie Wolf advised the Board if we are going to learn from the High School project, the roof was put on during new construction. It needs to go on right. Someone needs to oversee the project to make sure that we don't have an installation problem. We need to make sure that we are sensible in decisions so that the warranty stands true with wind speeds. This takes away their out.
31. Mr. Wolf questioned who determines the factor on what the wind speed really was.
32. Mr. Kerr asked to have the timeline reviewed. When do we want to go out to bid? We are going to do a primary bid and an alternate bid.
33. Mr. Barrick stated we want in the specs for the EPDM roof that we want a white roof not a black roof.
34. Mr. Wolf questioned if there is any concern with doing this in one year or if it will take two years.

**Big Spring School Board Buildings and Property Committee Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 17, 2016**

III. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:00 P.M.

Robert Lee Barrick, Chairperson